

# Better Pay for Better Teaching

Bryan C. Hassel  
Progressive Policy Institute  
May 29, 2002

# Improving Teaching Quality

- Entice more high-potential teachers
- Convince effective teachers to stay
- Encourage great teachers to take tough assignments
- Enhance teachers' capacity
- Increase use of effective practices
- Induce ineffective teachers to leave

# Key Elements of New Approach

- Change the way we prepare, recruit, select, support, and evaluate
- Increase pay overall
- *Change the way we pay*

# New One-Size-Fits-All System?

NO:

- We know little about "what works"
- Schools differ:  
*no one best way to pay*

# Principles of Policy Design

- Experimentation the *rule*, not the exception
- Flexibility at the school-level
- Hold harmless: no reductions in pay

# Principles of Policy Design, cont.

- Intense focus on results
- Alignment: don't change pay alone
- Rigorous documentation and evaluation

# Why Pay Matters

- Composition effects:

who teaches,  
who stays

- Behavior effects:  
how teachers  
teach and  
develop

# The Current System

- Rewards experience and education
- Arguments:
  - Good proxies for teaching quality
  - Fairness & simplicity

# Good Proxies for Quality?

- Lots of great veteran, highly educated teachers
- Studies: little or no overall link to student learning
- Even if linked, not the *best* proxies

# Fairness?

- Yes, ignores irrelevant factors
- But also ignores relevant factors:
  - Teacher knowledge and skills
  - Learning achieved by students
  - Difficulty of assignment

# Status Quo and Teaching Quality

|                                     | Yes | No |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Entice more great teachers          |     | ✓  |
| Convince effective teachers to stay |     | ✓  |
| Induce teachers to take tough jobs  |     | ✓  |
| Enhance teachers' capacity          |     | ✓  |
| Increase use of effective practices |     | ✓  |
| Encourage weak teachers to leave    |     | ✓  |

# Two Key Aspects of New Policy

- What factors drive pay
- Who sets pay

# What Factors Drive Pay

- Paying for knowledge and skills
- Paying more for high-demand specialties
- Paying more for hard-to-staff schools
- Paying for performance

# Evaluating Proposals

- Likely contribution to teaching quality:
  - Composition effects
  - Behavior effects
- Standard: relative to status quo

# Pay for Knowledge and Skills

|                                     | Yes | No |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Entice more great teachers          | ✓   |    |
| Convince effective teachers to stay | ✓   |    |
| Induce teachers to take tough jobs  |     | ✓  |
| Enhance teachers' capacity          | ✓   |    |
| Increase use of effective practices |     | ✓  |
| Encourage weak teachers to leave    | ✓   |    |

# Pay More for High-Demand Specialties

|                                     | Yes | No |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Entice more great teachers          | ✓   |    |
| Convince effective teachers to stay | ✓   |    |
| Induce teachers to take tough jobs  |     | ✓  |
| Enhance teachers' capacity          |     | ✓  |
| Increase use of effective practices |     | ✓  |
| Encourage weak teachers to leave    |     | ✓  |

# Pay More for Hard-to-Staff Schools

|                                     | Yes | No |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Entice more great teachers          |     | ✓  |
| Convince effective teachers to stay |     | ✓  |
| Induce teachers to take tough jobs  | ✓   |    |
| Enhance teachers' capacity          |     | ✓  |
| Increase use of effective practices |     | ✓  |
| Encourage weak teachers to leave    |     | ✓  |

# Paying for Performance

|                                     | Yes | No |
|-------------------------------------|-----|----|
| Entice more great teachers          | ✓   |    |
| Convince effective teachers to stay | ✓   |    |
| Induce teachers to take tough jobs  |     | ✓  |
| Enhance teachers' capacity          | ✓   |    |
| Increase use of effective practices | ✓   |    |
| Encourage weak teachers to leave    | ✓   |    |

# Design Issues and Options

- What exactly to reward
- How to measure
- Alignment with other strategies
- Supplement or replace
- How much to pay
- How to fund
- Transition

# Changing Who Sets Pay

- Status quo: state and district scales
- The challenge: *alignment*
- Solution: school-level pay-setting
- "School leaders": not necessarily principals  
(example: teacher ownership)

# Complements to Flexible Pay

- Hold school leaders accountable
- Grant HR and budget autonomy to schools
- Build leaders' capacity to set pay
- Foster external providers of teacher evaluation and pay approaches
- Address equity issues

# Some Middle Grounds

- Partial decentralization
- School discretion, within parameters
- Phase-in

# The Future of Teacher Pay

- Experimentation
- Flexibility
- The bargain:

Better Pay, Better Pay *Systems*